# Supergravity from 2 and 3-Algebra Gauge Theory





+

Henrik Johansson CERN June 10, 2013

### Twelfth Workshop on Non-Perturbative Quantum Chromodynamics,

l'Institut d'Astrophysique de Paris

Work with: Zvi Bern, John Joseph Carrasco; Yu-tin Huang, Sangmin Lee



### **Text-Book: perturbative gravity is complicated !**

de Donder gauge: 
$$\mathcal{L}=rac{2}{\kappa^2}\sqrt{g}R, \quad g_{\mu
u}=\eta_{\mu
u}+\kappa h_{\mu
u}$$

$$\sum_{\mu_1}^{\nu_1} \sum_{\mu_2}^{\nu_2} = \frac{1}{2} \left[ \eta_{\mu_1\nu_1} \eta_{\mu_2\nu_2} + \eta_{\mu_1\nu_2} \eta_{\nu_1\mu_2} - \frac{2}{D-2} \eta_{\mu_1\mu_2} \eta_{\nu_1\nu_2} \right] \frac{i}{p^2 + i\epsilon}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} k_{2} \\ \mu_{2} \\ \mu_{2} \\ \mu_{3} \\ \mu_{4} \\ \mu_{1} \end{array} = \operatorname{sym}[-\frac{1}{2}P_{3}(k_{1} \cdot k_{2}\eta_{\mu_{1}\nu_{1}}\eta_{\mu_{2}\nu_{2}}\eta_{\mu_{3}\nu_{3}}) - \frac{1}{2}P_{6}(k_{1\mu_{1}}k_{1\nu_{2}}\eta_{\mu_{1}\nu_{1}}\eta_{\mu_{3}\nu_{3}}) + \frac{1}{2}P_{3}(k_{1} \cdot k_{2}\eta_{\mu_{1}\mu_{2}}\eta_{\nu_{1}\nu_{2}}\eta_{\mu_{3}\nu_{3}}) \\ + P_{6}(k_{1} \cdot k_{2}\eta_{\mu_{1}\nu_{1}}\eta_{\mu_{2}\mu_{3}}\eta_{\nu_{2}\nu_{3}}) + 2P_{3}(k_{1\mu_{2}}k_{1\nu_{3}}\eta_{\mu_{1}\nu_{1}}\eta_{\nu_{2}\mu_{3}}) - P_{3}(k_{1\nu_{2}}k_{2\mu_{1}}\eta_{\nu_{1}\mu_{1}}\eta_{\mu_{3}\nu_{3}}) \\ + P_{3}(k_{1\mu_{3}}k_{2\nu_{3}}\eta_{\mu_{1}\mu_{2}}\eta_{\nu_{1}\nu_{2}}) + P_{6}(k_{1\mu_{3}}k_{1\nu_{3}}\eta_{\mu_{1}\mu_{2}}\eta_{\nu_{1}\nu_{2}}) + 2P_{6}(k_{1\mu_{2}}k_{2\nu_{3}}\eta_{\nu_{2}\mu_{1}}\eta_{\nu_{1}\mu_{3}}) \\ + 2P_{3}(k_{1\mu_{2}}k_{2\mu_{1}}\eta_{\nu_{2}\mu_{3}}\eta_{\nu_{3}\nu_{1}}) - 2P_{3}(k_{1} \cdot k_{2}\eta_{\nu_{1}\mu_{2}}\eta_{\nu_{2}\mu_{3}}\eta_{\nu_{3}\mu_{1}})] \\ After symmetrization \\ \sim 100 \text{ terms }! \end{array}$$

higher order vertices...





• • •

## **On-shell simplifications**

**Graviton plane wave:** 

$$\varepsilon^{\mu}(p)\varepsilon^{\nu}(p)\,e^{ip\cdot x}$$

Yang-Mills polarization

Mana Milla ana alitada

### 

**Gravity scattering amplitude:** 

**On-shell 3-graviton vertex:** 

$$M_{\text{tree}}^{\text{GR}}(1,2,3,4) = \frac{st}{u} A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{YM}}(1,2,3,4) \otimes A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{YM}}(1,2,3,4)$$
$$\stackrel{d=3}{\longrightarrow} A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{CSm}}(1,2,3,4) \otimes A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{CSm}}(1,2,3,4)$$
$$\stackrel{\text{Chern-Simons-matter theory}}{\longrightarrow} K_{\text{tree}}^{\text{CSm}}(1,2,3,4) \otimes A_{\text{tree}}^{\text{CSm}}(1,2,3,4)$$

Gravity processes = squares of gauge theory ones - entire S-matrix H. Johansson Bern, Carrasco, HJ [BCJ]

# Outline

- Motivation D=3 amplitudes
- Duality between Color and Kinematics
  - Kinematical Lie 2-Algebra (Yang-Mills theory)
  - Kinematical Lie 3-Algebra (Chern-Simons-matter theory)
  - Gravity as a Double Copy of YM and CSm theories
- Amplitudes in BLG, ABJM and D=2 SUGRA
  - Tree-Amplitude relations
  - Dimensional reduction: D=2 ABJM
  - Integrability of D=2 SUGRA?
- Conclusions

# Why Amplitudes in *D*=3 (or *D*=2)

→Travaglini's talk

- N=8 Bagger-Lambert-Gustavsson (BLG) theory
- N=6 Aharony-Bergman-Jafferis-Maldacena (ABJM) theory
- Chern-Simons-matter (CSM) theories enticing gauge theories
- **•** The celebrated  $AdS_4/CFT_3$
- In D=2: supergravity integrability Nicolai, Warner

Comparing CSM  $\leftarrow \rightarrow$  SYM "Same but different"

 Similar phenomena as in D=4 SYM
 Yangian/Dual conformal sym. (ABJM)
 Grassmannian formulation (ABJM)
 Lee; Huang, Lee
 Color-kinematics duality (BLG, ABJM,...)
 Bargheer, Loebbert, Meneghelli; Huang, Lipstein

# **2-algebra Color-Kinematics Duality**

**D-dim.** Yang-Mills theories are controlled by a kinematic Lie algebra

• Amplitude represented by cubic graphs:

Duality: color ↔ kinematics

Bern, Carrasco, HJ

numerators

### Some details of color-kinematics duality

can be checked for 4pt on-shell ampl. using Feynman rules

Example with two quarks:



- **1.**  $(A^{\mu})^4$  contact interactions absorbed into cubic graphs
  - by hand 1=s/s
  - or by auxiliary field  $B \sim (A^\mu)^2$
- 2. Beyond 4-pts duality not automatic  $\rightarrow$  Lagrangian reorganization
- 3. Known to work at tree level: all-*n* example Kiermaier; Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Sondergaard, Vanhove
- 4. Enforces (BCJ) relations on partial amplitudes  $\rightarrow$  (*n*-3)! Basis

also in string theory:

Bjerrum-Bohr, Damgaard, Vanhove; Stieberger

### **Gravity is a double copy**

• Gravity amplitudes obtained by replacing color with kinematics

$$\mathcal{A}_{m}^{(L)} = \sum_{i \in \text{cubic}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_{i}} \frac{n_{i}c_{i}}{p_{i_{1}}^{2}p_{i_{2}}^{2}p_{i_{3}}^{2}\cdots p_{i_{l}}^{2}}$$
BCJ
$$\mathcal{M}_{m}^{(L)} = \sum_{i \in \text{cubic}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_{i}} \frac{n_{i}\tilde{n}_{i}}{p_{i_{1}}^{2}p_{i_{2}}^{2}p_{i_{3}}^{2}\cdots p_{i_{l}}^{2}}$$

• The two numerators can belong to different theories:

$$n_{i} \qquad \tilde{n}_{i}$$

$$(\mathcal{N}=4) \times (\mathcal{N}=4) \rightarrow \qquad \mathcal{N}=8 \text{ sugra}$$

$$(\mathcal{N}=4) \times (\mathcal{N}=2) \rightarrow \qquad \mathcal{N}=6 \text{ sugra}$$

$$(\mathcal{N}=4) \times (\mathcal{N}=0) \rightarrow \qquad \mathcal{N}=4 \text{ sugra}$$

similar to Kawai-Lewellen-Tye but works at loop level

 $(\mathcal{N}=0) \times (\mathcal{N}=0) \rightarrow$  Einstein gravity + axion+ dilaton

## **3-algebra Color-Kinematics Duality**

D=3 Chern-Simons matter theories Bargheer, He, McLoughlin; bey color-kinematics duality Huang, HJ.

**3-algebra Fundamental identity (Jacobi identity):** 

Bagger, Lambert; Gustavsson

 $f^{abc[d}f^{egh]a} = 0$ 

$$c_s = c_t + c_u + c_v \Leftrightarrow n_s = n_t + n_u + n_v$$

4 and 6 point checks shows that the double copy of BLG Is  $N = 16 E_{8(8)}$  SG of Marcus and Schwarz

BLG ='square root' of N=16 SG 
$$A_4^{\text{BLG}} = \sqrt{M_4^{\mathcal{N}=16}} = \sqrt{\frac{\delta^{16}(Q)}{stu}}$$

### **D**≤3 supergravity is a double copy of CSM

• Gravity amplitudes obtained by replacing color with kinematics **BCJ** 

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{A}_{m}^{(L)} &= \sum_{i \in \text{quartic}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_i} \frac{n_i c_i}{p_{i_1}^2 p_{i_2}^2 p_{i_3}^2 \cdots p_{i_l}^2} \\ \mathcal{M}_{m}^{(L)} &= \sum_{i \in \text{quartic}} \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{LD}} \frac{1}{S_i} \frac{n_i \tilde{n}_i}{p_{i_1}^2 p_{i_2}^2 p_{i_3}^2 \cdots p_{i_l}^2} \end{split} \\ \end{split}$$

- No string understanding (cf. Kawai-Lewellen-Tye)
- Details more subtle than in SYM 
   SYM
- Huang, HJ, Lee
- **BLG**  $\otimes$  **BLG** works in **D**=3 (verified: tree level  $\leq$  10pts)
- ABJM  $\otimes$  ABJM works in *D*=3 at 4,6pts, but not  $\geq$ 8pts
- ABJM  $\otimes$  ABJM works in **D**=2 (verified: tree level  $\leq$  10pts)

# BLG, ABJM and D=2 SUGRA

### **ABJM and BLG theory**

**ABJM:** N=6 CSm theory with U(N)×U(N) gauge group  $\rightarrow$  Travaglini's talk

Matter are the only propagating *d.o.f.*: bi-fundamental representation Chiral  $(N, \overline{N})$  multiplet:

$$\Phi = \phi^4 + \eta^A \psi_A + \frac{1}{2} \epsilon_{ABC} \eta^A \eta^B \phi^C + \frac{1}{3!} \epsilon_{ABC} \eta^A \eta^B \eta^C \psi_4$$

$$\mathbf{1} \qquad \mathbf{3} \qquad \mathbf{1}$$

In total 16 states (same spectrum as *N*=4 SYM, but chiral)

BLG: N=8 CSm theory with SU(2)×SU(2) = SO(4) gauge group Matter is non-chiral  $N = \overline{N}$   $\Phi = \phi + \eta^A \psi_A + \frac{1}{2} \eta^A \eta^B \phi_{AB} + \frac{1}{3!} \eta^A \eta^B \eta^C \epsilon_{ABCD} \overline{\psi}^D + \frac{1}{4!} \eta^A \eta^B \eta^C \eta^D \epsilon_{ABCD} \overline{\phi}$ 1 4 6 4 1 In total 16 states

### **ABJM and BLG are three-algebras**

Bi-fundamental matter theories are three-algebra theories Bagger, Lambert; Bagger, Bruhn

Triple product of *N*×*M* matrices;

$$[M^{a}, M^{b}; M^{\bar{c}}] \equiv (M^{a}M^{\bar{c}}M^{b} - M^{b}M^{\bar{c}}M^{a})^{\alpha'}{}_{\beta} \equiv f^{ab\bar{c}}{}_{d} (M^{d})^{\alpha'}{}_{\beta}$$

Structure constants satisfy fundamental identity (Jacob identity)

$$\begin{aligned} f^{ab\bar{f}}_{\ g} f^{gc\bar{d}\bar{e}} - f^{ac\bar{d}}_{\ g} f^{gb\bar{f}\bar{e}} - f^{bc\bar{d}}_{\ g} f^{ag\bar{f}\bar{e}} + f^{gc\bar{d}\bar{f}} f^{ab\ \bar{e}}_{\ g} = 0 \\ \end{aligned}$$
Obtained from Feynman diag.  

$$g^{1}_{\ 4} \int_{a}^{ac\bar{c}} f^{ac\bar{d}\bar{f}}_{\ 3} + g^{ac\bar{d}\bar{f}}_{\ 4} \int_{a}^{ac\bar{c}} f^{ab\ \bar{e}}_{\ 3} + g^{ac\bar{d}\bar{f}}_{\ 4} \int_{a}^{ac\bar{c}} f^{ab\ \bar{e}}_{\ 3} \\ f^{ab\bar{c}\bar{d}} = g(T_A)^{a\bar{c}} (T^A)^{b\bar{d}} + g'(T_B)^{a\bar{d}} (T^B)^{b\bar{c}} \\ \end{aligned}$$
Interesting choices:  

$$g = -g' \text{ or } g = g'$$

### Symmetries of structure constants

• ABJM theory 
$$f^{ab\bar{c}\bar{d}} = -f^{ab\bar{d}\bar{c}}$$
 complex, antisymmetric in pairs  
• BLG theory  $f^{abcd}$  real and totally antisymmetric  
• N=5 CSM theory  $f^{ab\bar{c}\bar{d}} = -f^{ab\bar{d}\bar{c}}$  or  $f^{ab\bar{c}\bar{d}} = f^{ab\bar{d}\bar{c}}$   
real, (anti)symmetric in pairs Bagger, Bruhn  
Consider amplitudes:  $\mathcal{A}_m = i\left(\frac{2\pi}{k}\right)^{\frac{m-2}{2}} \sum_{i \in \text{quartic}} \frac{n_i c_i}{\prod_{\alpha_i} s_{\alpha_i}}$   
 $c_i = f^{ab\bar{c}\bar{d}} f^{de\bar{f}\bar{g}} \dots f^{wx\bar{y}\bar{z}}$ 

What are their properties?

Kleiss-Kuijf relations
 Color-kinematics duality → BCJ relations
 double copy = supergravity

### **ABJM amplitude relations**

#### **Consider ABJM at 6pts**

Bargheer, He, McLoughlin; Huang, HJ.

$$\mathcal{A}_{m} = \sum_{i \in \text{quartic}} \frac{n_{i}c_{i}}{\prod_{\alpha_{i}} s_{\alpha_{i}}} \qquad \xrightarrow{\text{Solve Jacobi}} \qquad A_{(i)} = \sum_{j=1}^{p} \Theta_{ij}n_{j}$$
  
At 6pts (ABJM): 
$$\Theta_{ij} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{s_{1}} & \frac{1}{s_{2}} + \frac{1}{s_{9}} & \frac{1}{s_{9}} & -\frac{1}{s_{9}} & 0\\ \frac{1}{s_{8}} & -\frac{1}{s_{8}} & \frac{1}{s_{3}} & \frac{1}{s_{4}} + \frac{1}{s_{8}} & 0\\ \frac{1}{s_{7}} & -\frac{1}{s_{7}} & -\frac{1}{s_{6}} - \frac{1}{s_{7}} & \frac{1}{s_{6}} + \frac{1}{s_{7}} & \frac{1}{s_{5}} + \frac{1}{s_{6}} + \frac{1}{s_{7}}\\ 0 & -\frac{1}{s_{9}} & -\frac{1}{s_{3}} - \frac{1}{s_{9}} & -\frac{1}{s_{9}} & -\frac{1}{s_{9}} & -\frac{1}{s_{6}} \\ 0 & -\frac{1}{s_{2}} & \frac{1}{s_{6}} & -\frac{1}{s_{4}} - \frac{1}{s_{6}} & -\frac{1}{s_{6}} \end{pmatrix}$$

5×5 matrix has rank 4, but only in D=3 and on-shell !

**5-term amplitude relation:** 

$$\operatorname{Ker}(\Theta^{T}) \cdot A = \sum_{i=1}^{5} C_{ik} A_{(i)} = 0$$
$$\operatorname{Det}(\Theta_{i1}, \Theta_{i2}, \dots, A_{(i)}, \dots, \Theta_{ip}) = 0$$

### **BLG amplitude relations**

Huang, HJ, Lee

#### **Consider BLG at 6pts**





5×5 matrix has rank 3, but only in D=3 and on-shell !

4-term amplitude relation:

$$\operatorname{Ker}(\Theta^{T}) \cdot A = \sum_{i=1}^{4} C_{ik} A_{(i)} = 0$$
$$\operatorname{Det}(\Theta_{i1}, \Theta_{i2}, \dots, A_{(i)}, \dots, \Theta_{ip}) = 0$$

H. Johansson

### **BLG and ABJM amplitude relations**

**BLG: 4-term amplitude relation:** 

$$0 = \sum_{i=2}^{5} S_i A_{(i)}$$

$$\begin{split} S_2 &= s_{124}(s_{156}(s_{145}s_{146} - s_{135}s_{136}) + s_{126}(s_{146}(s_{135} + s_{156}) - s_{136}(s_{145} + s_{156})))\,, \\ S_3 &= s_{145}(s_{156}(s_{136}(s_{124} + s_{126} + s_{135}) + s_{146}(s_{136} - s_{126})) - s_{126}s_{146}(s_{124} + s_{135} + s_{136}))\,, \\ S_4 &= s_{156}(s_{136}s_{145}(s_{124} + s_{126} + s_{135}) + s_{146}(s_{136}(s_{126} + s_{135}) + s_{145}(s_{135} + s_{136}) + s_{124}(s_{126} + s_{145})))\,, \\ S_5 &= -s_{126}(s_{145}s_{146}(s_{124} + s_{135} + s_{156}) + s_{136}(s_{135}(s_{145} + s_{146}) + s_{124}(s_{145} + s_{156}) + s_{146}(s_{145} + s_{156})))\,, \end{split}$$

(plus one additional relation)

ABJM-type theory (in *D*=2): 4-term amplitude relations:

$$0 = (A_{(1)}s_{123} - A_{(2)}s_{124})(s_{126}s_{146} - s_{136}s_{156}) + (A_{(4)}s_{146} - A_{(5)}s_{136})(s_{126}s_{156} + s_{123}s_{126} + s_{123}s_{156})$$

$$0 = (A_{(2)}s_{124} - A_{(3)}s_{145})(s_{126}s_{146} - s_{136}s_{156}) + (A_{(4)}s_{156} - A_{(5)}s_{126})(s_{145}s_{146} + s_{136}s_{145} + s_{136}s_{146}) + (A_{(4)}s_{156} - A_{(5)}s_{126})(s_{145}s_{146} + s_{136}s_{146}) + (A_{(4)}s_{156} - A_{(5)}s_{146})(s_{145}s_{146} + s_{136}s_{146}) + (A_{(4)}s_{156} - A_{(5)}s_{146})(s_{146} + s_{136}s_{146}) + (A_{(4)}s_{146} + s_{146}s_{146})(s_{146} + s_{146}s_{146}) + (A_{(4)}s_{146} + s_{146}s_{146})(s_{146} + s_{146}s_$$

Huang, HJ, Lee

# **ABJM and BLG data collection**

#### **ABJM theory counts:**

Huang, HJ, Lee

external legs	4	6	8	10	m = 2k + 2
quartic diagrams	1	9	216	9900	$\frac{(3k)!(k+1)!}{(2k+1)!(2!)^k}$
planar amplitudes	1	6	72	1440	$\frac{1}{2}(k+1)!k!$
diagrams in $A^{\text{planar}}$	1	3	12	55	$\frac{(3k)!}{k!(2k+1)!}$
distinct fundamental id's	0	9	432	29700	$\frac{(k-1)(3k)!(k+1)!}{(2k+1)!(2!)^k}$
KK-indep. ampls.	1	5	57	1144	*
BCJ-indep. ampls. $D = 2$	1	3	38	987	*

### **BLG theory counts:**

external legs	4	6	8	10	m = 2k + 2
quartic diagrams	1	10	280	15400	$\frac{(3k)!}{k!(3!)^k}$
distinct fundamental id's	0	15	840	69300	$\frac{3}{2}(k-1)\frac{(3k)!}{k!(3!)^k}$
KK-indep. ampls.	1	5	56	1077	*
BCJ-indep. ampls. $D = 3$	1	3	38	1029	*

### Note: no simple combinatorial patterns for KK and BCJ counts.

### Same D=3 Supergravity Either Way

In *D*=3, supergravity from two different double copies:



- The extra propagators in SYM  $\otimes$  SYM compensates for dimension mismatch
- SYM has even and odd matrix elements, CSM only even!
- R-symmetry constrains ensure that double copy kills odd SYM contributions

For N=16 SUGRA: all states are SO(16) spinors -> no odd S-matrix elements Marcus and Schwarz

## **D=2** Supergravity and Integrability

- Easy access to D=2 supergravity S-matrix Huang, HJ, Lee
- Problem: a *D*=2 massless S-matrix has severe IR divergences
- Possible to restrict to amplitudes without soft or collinear div's



Can check integrability of *D*=2 supergravity S-matrix (in restricted momenta)

Nicolai, Warner

### **D=2 ABJM and supergravity ampls**

### **D=2 ABJM amplitudes:**

#### Huang, HJ, Lee

**4pts:** 
$$A_{D=2}^{\text{ABJM}}(\bar{1}, 2, \bar{3}, 4) = i \frac{\delta^{(3)}(\sum_{\text{even}} \lambda_i \eta_i) \delta^{(3)}(\sum_{\text{odd}} \bar{\lambda}_i \eta_i)}{\bar{\lambda}_1 \lambda_2 \bar{\lambda}_3 \lambda_4}$$

#### 6pts:

$$A_{D=2}^{\text{ABJM}}(\bar{1}2\bar{3}4\bar{5}6) = i\frac{\delta^{(3)}(\sum_{\text{even}}\lambda_i\eta_i)\delta^{(3)}(\sum_{\text{odd}}\bar{\lambda}_i\eta_i)}{\bar{\lambda}_1\lambda_2\bar{\lambda}_3\lambda_4\bar{\lambda}_5\lambda_6} \sum_{s=\pm}\delta^{(3)}\left(s\frac{\bar{\lambda}_3\eta_1 - \bar{\lambda}_1\eta_3}{\bar{\lambda}_5} + i\frac{\lambda_6\eta_4 - \lambda_4\eta_6}{\lambda_2}\right)$$

### **D=2** supergravity:

**4pts:** 
$$M_{D=2}(\bar{1}, 2, \bar{3}, 4) = [A_{D=2}^{ABJM}(1, \bar{2}, 3, \bar{4})]^2$$
 (finite and non-zero)

#### 6pts:

$$\mathcal{M}_{6}(\bar{1}2\bar{3}4\bar{5}6) = \frac{s_{12}s_{34}s_{56}}{(s_{23} - s_{14})(s_{36} - s_{12})(s_{34} - s_{16})} \left( (s_{34} - s_{16})A_{(1)}\tilde{A}_{(1)} + (s_{36} - s_{12})A_{(2)}\tilde{A}_{(2)} + (s_{23} - s_{14})A_{(3)}\tilde{A}_{(3)} \right)$$
6. The amplitude vanishes  $\rightarrow$  consistent with integrability.

6pt amplitude vanishes  $\rightarrow$  consistent with integrability

### Yang-Baxter Eqn



 $\rightarrow$  more checks are needed, as well as better understanding of IR div.

### Conclusions

- Yang-Mills theories are controlled by a kinematic Lie 2-algebra
- **Chern-Simons-matter theories controlled by a kinematic Lie 3-algebra**
- The explicit kinematic algebra is still missing for all but the simplest case of self-dual Yang-Mills.
- With duality manifest: Gravity becomes double copy. double copy of CSM theory = double copy of D≤3 SYM
- BCJ relations/double copy present in D=3 for BLG theories
- BCJ relations/double copy present in D=2 for ABJM theories
- **Simple access to** D=2 **supergravity S-matrix**  $\rightarrow$  **checks of integrability**
- C-K duality is a key tool for nonplanar gauge and gravity calculations.
  - Loop amplitudes in BLG (ABJM)...
  - N=8 supergravity UV behavior at 5 (and 7) loops...
  - N=4 supergravity UV behavior at 3,4 loops ...